



HAWAII 2050 SUSTAINABILITY TASK FORCE



Sen. Russell Kokubun,
Chair

Fall Community Meeting Nānāikapono Elementary School, October 16, 2007

Rep. Lyla Berg
Rep. Pono Chong
Sen. Suzanne Chun Oakland
Ian Costa
Henry Eng
Sen. Mike Gabbard
David Goode
Marion M. Higa
Jeffrey Hunt
Dr. Karl Kim
Millie Kim
Keith Kurahashi
Brad Kurokawa
Rep. Colleen Meyer
Keith Rollman
Dr. James Spencer
Jane Testa
Laura Thielen
Stacie Thorlakson
Beth Tokioka
Sen. Jill Tokuda
Michael Tresler
Pamela Tumpap
Rep. Ryan Yamane

Participants

Irene Awana
Rep. Karen Awana
Jolyn Ballenti
Karen Barbalace
Deborah Bunton
Derek Burke
Puanani Burgess
Grant Chartrand
Russell Cruz
Dolores Foley
Chris Garcia
Lucy Gay
Scott Glenn
Polly "Granny" Grace
Lauren Hallonquist
Adrian Hill
Chang Yu Hong
Kapua Kamahele
Koichi Kamikura
Kimo Kelii
Maki Kobayashi
Keith Kurahashi
Jeff Kuwabara
Poka Laenui
Luwella K. Leonardi
Elizabeth Louis

Casanova Love
Nohea Mahelena
Donaleia Maliwousky
Annie McCollough
Sean McNamara
Nicole Milne
Hitomi Obaia
Edwin Obregon
Michael Olm
Joonghee Park
Pat Patterson
Maria Plottier
Ralph Saito
Denise Saylor
Padmendra Shrestha
Kelly Shurgst
Nicole Smith
Malia Tector
Mapuana Tector
Sarah Uphoff
Sara Walters
Alicia Whitehill
Sr. Malia Wong
Tiffany Wtoski

Facilitators:

Robert Agres, Jr.
Scott Glenn
Lauren Hallonquist
Chang Yu Hong
Maki Kobayashi

Elizabeth Louis
Larissa Meinecke
Nicole Milne
Joonghee Park
Padmendra Shrestha



Following a brief presentation of the draft plan, participants were asked to join a small “break-out group” for discussion. Each group was asked to first offer comments about the draft plan goals, strategic actions and indicators. They were asked to identify what they saw as positives – things that they thought were especially important or on point; things they thought were negatives – things they didn’t agree with or didn’t understand; and things they thought were missing. The groups were then asked to give comments on the draft implementation and accountability plan. They were asked specifically to comment on what they saw as the strengths of the proposed sustainability council; what they saw as weaknesses of the proposed sustainability council and how they might be addressed; and any other general comments they might have about the plan for implementation and accountability. Their input will be considered by the H2050 Sustainability Task Force as it revises the draft H2050 Sustainability Plan.

The goals in the draft plan are:

- Goal I – A Way of Life
- Goal II – The Economy
- Goal III – Environment and Natural Resources
- Goal IV – Community and Social Well Being
- Goal V – Kanaka Maoli Culture and Island Values

GROUP 1



➤ Discussion: Plan goals, strategic actions and indicators

What are the positives – things that are really important or on point?

- Idea that we are trying to do something.
- Focus on resources.
- Focusing on education – some resources on education.
- Recycling is a priority.
- Looking at sea-rising, losing Honolulu harbor would be bad.
- Importance of on-going forums and dialogues.
- Reducing urban sprawl, reducing land usage – good.
- More locally grown food – good.
- Indicators for public transportation – but no way to do that.
- All indicators and goals are connected.
- Looks at education – increase money, teach kids when they are young.
- Looking at idea of a 2nd city.

What are the negatives – things that you don't agree with or don't understand?

- Big problem - makes assumption we live on a continent rather than an island.
- Where we are is where we are going to be. Doesn't examine what's happening.
- Takes into account that they need energy but not renewable energy.
- No restraints on high consumers. How do we sustain ourselves on this island?
- Need to look at other ways – cost of resources (internal conflict in the plan).
- Problems – trucks come, don't know when, what time, need to know access (trash day, recycle day) – they are very limited.
- Businesses – need to use recycled water instead of fresh water.
- Businesses – monitoring, example – Costco big boxes.
- Hawai'i – Matson – give and take, only so far – sell businesses idea of regulating them.
- Raw & different, too broad to measure.
- Award businesses and people with something.
- Water consumption – good idea in goal but not realistic; see people waste water.
- Water – more people coming to islands, need to look at condos – people moving in, more houses = more water use.
- Find out capacity limit.
- See a lot of abandoned cars – no fees.
- Want to see – more public transportation that uses renewable resources – will save money.



- Regulation of cars – pollution.
- Increasing access to public transportation – a lot now, but it is being used? How reliable?
- Expensive to afford household; must take care of basic needs.
- Too expensive for basic needs – if made locally could be cheaper instead of importing foods (shipping between islands is expensive).
- Do it proportionally – need to spread out growing of local foods.

What do you think is missing from this section of the plan that is critical?

- Indicators of what people feel.
- Feedback and awareness to the public.
- Actual steps for planning sustainability in State.
- Natural energy sources – wind, solar, etc.
- More affordable energy access.
- No indicator for incentives.
- Goal 4 – Homelessness: no helpful, major problem.
- We need to do something.
- There is nothing for homeless children.



➤ Discussion: Concept of Sustainability Council

What do you see as the strengths of the proposed Sustainability Council?

- Audit of Council – good idea.

What are the shortcomings or weaknesses?

- 15 is a low number to represent the State.
- Too high of a number.
- At least 2 representatives per a community.
- How do the Council members serve?
- Who will put them on the Council?
- Needs to be representative of the area they live – so different areas.
- Representing who? How do you make it so it's not top-down?
- Access to Council?
- Groups linked to the Council – accountability.
- Semi-annual report is better – or maybe a quarterly report available to the public.
- Present report in any way possible to the community.
- Community must know its here and available.
- Needs to have resources for Council and stuff it does.
- Add tourism, business to Council and get money for Council.
- Constantly revisit these goals – look at when doing the semi-annual report.
- Focus on strategic indicators and strategies for progress.
- What authority should the Council have? Should they have more influence? Some people don't want to do these things. At what point do recommendations have any effect?
- Council – spread word, make sure people are recycling.

Other comments about the sustainability council?

- At some point, we will reach the goals; then we must revise – need to constantly improve.
- Unless you have to do it, no one will do it – must become a law.
- Want people of influence to look at it.
- Say no to billboards yet no recycling – look at other places and case studies to adopt.
- Military can recycle. Have a representative on Council since it involves them too, each branch has its own views.
- Increase military awareness.
- Big difference between military & civilian side – task force can get ideas from the military.



- Council should be nominated – diverse; can't do now – when it starts to pick up, community leaders.
- Should have elections one year from now; people will vote since it's a presidential election.
- Break down by districts.
- Mandatory that it is in each school – newsletters with kids at work.
- Print out yearly and annual budget – make public – real budget and preliminary budget; so do not overspend.
- Council held accountable or be removed – can be kicked off.
- Show progress – how? Why reach goals? Give community continual progress report. How is the public accountable?
- Accountability – slap businesses with a fee.
- Should they get paid? Decide once they start.
- Be more specific on Council section.
- Needs to be full-time position.
- Advisory subgroups – specific – depends on how many one board – district representatives.
- As long as don't spend \$3k – good.
- Tax cigarettes & alcohol for funding money for Council & staff.
- Extra taxes on big vehicles – Hummers, etc. – to provide funding.
- Don't affect gas price.
- Taxing hotels – brings revenue yet should they be held accountable. Should regulate, e.g. water, recycling (give fine if not).
- Is Council a lobbying group?
- Adopt-a-highway – work with businesses to adopt the community and give back.
- Don't want substitutes for big agricultural endeavors.
- Students point-of-view important on the Council – introduce to young people – high school, college students on Council.

How can we engage the general public in taking action to promote Hawai'i's sustainability?

- Here in Wai'anae, process not wide enough, not bringing in the community.
- There should be more advertisement on HI 2050.
- Encourage young people – create awards and signs that HI2050 coming to town.

➤ Calabash

- Keep enforcing; keep talking to people to encourage them to make changes (small at first).
- Make convenient.
- Incentives to agencies and individuals.
- Should flood every media – do commercials, emails, everything we can to get the word out.

- Get budget for advertising HI2050 – get businesses to give back to the community.



➤ Discussion: Plan goals, strategic actions and indicators

What are the positives – things that are really important or on point?

- Background and origin.
- History of how this plan evolved.
- Historical → documents on hot water cables – docs in archives need to be brought out more than energy.
- Like language – need to have strong regulations (i.e. environment and invasive species).
- Ban scuba enforcement.
- Like guiding principles and triple bottom line approach.
- Mandatory recycling.
- Recycling technology – think about high technology like Germans.
- Like language in strategy 3 – workforce.
- Improve education in Hawai'i and keep students in Hawai'i.
- Energy consumption by sector.
- Sustainability ethic – public awareness - good.

What are the negatives – things that you don't agree with or don't understand?

- Didn't like save water.
- Saving of individuals and developers profiting – need policy.
- Information and goals scattered.
- Goal 2 – lacks details and specifics, e.g. military, construction (specific construction, agriculture – flowers/fruits).
- 20 percent caused from visiting industry, what about rest?
- Water shouldn't tax local more. How can Waikiki be more sustainable in terms of water?
- Education – students don't want to come back to Hawai'i. Help students come back and work for Hawai'i. Especially occurs with scholarship students.
- Indicators – how do we define Aloha Index?
- Overlapping of civic functions – state vs. county, e.g. Grey water & recycling – whose responsibility?
- Inject sustainability through elementary schools.
- Schools to family educating on sustainability.
- Change in Kanaka Maoli section → segregate from other cultures/ethnic groups, issues contradict between different cultures.
- Taskforce – when dealing with specifics needs fair representation.
- Emergency crisis – not clearly stated. Master plan needed – e.g. Hurricane, fire.



- Companies should be accountable for waste they generate. Water contamination.

What do you think is missing from this section of the plan that is critical?

- Ocean needs to be cleaned up (pollution, army).
- Bones Iwi – developers taking iwi away – not respectful.
- Iwi should be returned to property where it is found; put native plants.
- We need housing for elderly/affordable.
- Compatible with Section 8.
- Specialized training for entry level workforce in high technology.
- Schools can be in the recycling pilot programs.
- Traffic – reduce traffic congestion.
- Buses should run 24 hours.
- Agriculture – preserve rare species and plants.
- Affordable housing – locals get priorities.
- Funding source – how much?
- Island-wide transportation needs to be looked at, e.g., in England/Tokyo.
- Department of Hawaiian Homelands needs to be in task force.
- For coastline – need bypass road.
- Water protection – companies should be giving money for use of water (golf courses).
- Money should go to education.
- Let's ask companies to give back to Hawai'i.
- Don't bring workers from outside.
- Is there a limit of population? Quality of life trade off.
- Will legalized abortion solve problems?
- Educating children about sustainability – BTUs.
- Freshwater – arguments need to be made now for future.
- Bunkers – how far should it be?
- Issue of health and sustainability – need hospitals!!

➤ **Calabash**

- Statewide summits & forums should be open for public



➤ **Discussion: Concept of Sustainability Council**

What do you see as the strengths of the proposed Sustainability Council?

- None

What are the shortcomings or weaknesses?

- Appointed by Governor – raises suspicion of community.
- Open and transparent process needed.
- Hawaiian usage in Constitution in terms of freshwater.
- Want to see more of a geographic representation to represent regional issues.

Other comments about the sustainability council?

- Composition of Council – involvement of students through parent-teacher-student; letter writing; community, business, housewives, breadwinner, everybody's involvement, pastors, kūpuna, makua; get all the voices.
- Include City and County jurisdictions, e.g. zoning controlled by City does not allow State to control grey water – City would rather sell it to egg farmers; shoreline runoff controls – State doesn't have jurisdiction beyond shoreline; putting catchments, etc.
- In Japan, grab aquatic usage – Hawai'i doesn't have it.
- Who is going to represent Wai`anae area? Geographic representation.
- Rewards for students – some kind of incentive for involvement.
- How will 15 members have balance?
- 2050 plan may conflict other existing plans – how will this plan work?
- Movement building process to sustainability through grassroots levels.
- Is the plan going to be honored? Followed?
- Wai`anae sustainability plan not implemented.
- Attachment of the plan to the Auditor's Office - is it a right place?

GROUP 3

➤ Discussion: Plan goals, strategic actions and indicators

What are the positives – things that are really important or on point?

- Happy to see cultural issues addressed.
- Our group is lucky to have such diversity like in plan – military, Native Hawaiians, mainland transports, etc.

What are the negatives – things that you don't agree with or don't understand?

- How do we address population growth in regards to temporary residents? Immigrants, tourists, etc.
- A continental constitution misses island ecosystem issues.
- Plan does not address issues of Hawaiian sovereignty.
- Need to address infrastructure and balance is needed; should we limit/stop development?
- How will this plan be different from the last? Implementation is the key.
- If population growth not slowed /stabilized, will make achieving these goals difficult.
- Why and how should we support industries that are not operating sustainably?
- DOE's centralized organization limits success of education. Look at educational successes (i.e. charter schools).
- How do we make laws that discourage population growth?
- Plan must address race relations. How does the HI sovereignty issue enter into the plan?
- Wide gap in class due to globalization.
- Ordinance regarding waste management - should have congruency between issues you speak out about and how you live (dumps – not in my backyard syndrome).
- Infrastructure development must match housing/industrial development.
- Goals should work towards or include island self sustainability.
- State should support local agriculture.
- Living sustainability is a personal choice but sustainable living is not easy. The money saved though these efforts will help us through hard times.
- Sustainability now is hard because we must work to make money to afford to live here. Governor Ariyoshi's plan was sustainable because it limited population growth.
- Must live within our means. Worried about the effects of desalination.
- Clash between Hawai'i culture and capitalistic culture.



What do you think is missing from this section of the plan that is critical?

- Increase military awareness of Hawai'i's sustainability issues.
- Excessive housing growth and housing projects when island cannot support residents with food.
- Water supply in Waianae cannot support new development.
- Plan must stress water conservation; balance with development.
- Plan must address traffic congestion.
- More emphasis on land protection (Hawaiian homelands, ceded lands, crown lands).
- Increase education for Hawaiian language, Hawai'i culture.
- Cultural importance of fishing and gathering rights – laws that prohibit these are a problem.
- If increase housing development, need to increase infrastructure. Need for better planning.
- Improve high school education on sustainability/goals/issues.
- More information on daily sustainability practices the individual resident can do and what is the impact if people complied.
- Rework water distribution formula between ag/urban/conservation land.
- Look at energy distribution.
- Need multiple places to practice cultural events.
- Waste management – look at Seattle's zero waste management plan.
- Ancestral roots must be preserved. Need land and water for kalo (taro).
- Infrastructure issues are more than roads. We must look at police, libraries, medical facilities, trees; broaden the definition of infrastructure.
- Must make every business, gas station, coffee shops, schools, etc. have recycling options available to customers.
- Military housing doesn't pay for electricity and water so they tend to overuse resources. Need for military education and awareness or caps on usage (daily/monthly limits).
- Companies that provide electricity and water could also set limits.



➤ Discussion: Concept of Sustainability Council

What do you see as the strengths of the proposed Sustainability Council?

- None

What are the shortcomings or weaknesses?

- Not for Governor appointing Council. Needs to be done through community participation.
- Representative on Council from Hawaiian Homelands (7 governor appointees).
- Council becoming agenda driven – problem with 6 government appointees.
- Government appointees are susceptible to politics; need life-time appointees not to be ruled by politics and elections.
- Group consensus to do away with 6 government appointees.
- Create mechanism for ongoing community participation in implementation. Increases citizen accountability.
- Implementation problems due to funding and lack of citizen investment.
- Government needs to provide more than tax incentives to adopt sustainability practices (e.g. solar panels).
- Need to have incentives for housing developers to adopt sustainable practices.
- Need government accountability for all future buildings, etc. Need clearance from communities. A checklist!
- Need standards by which Council members will be selected. Must be fair & open-minded.
- Need representation by young, military, etc.
- How do ordinary Hawai'i residents find their way onto the Sustainability Council?
- Fair representation from sectors (rural, urban, etc) and classes.
- Get the military to cooperate with Council to work toward sustainability goals. Military comes up with a plan to regulate energy use on bases – would be a huge impact.
- Water will be the most important issue; plan will be compelling if it adequately addresses this issue.
- Implementation should think of after 2050; extend gaze of plan.

Other comments about the sustainability council?

- Community representation in the Council through community elections.
- Community referendum on the Council.



How can we engage the general public in taking action to promote Hawai'i's sustainability?

- Keep community in the loop – thru ads, banners, radio, etc.
- When these sustainability issues are addressed down the road, the public should be made aware of meetings so they can attend.
- Publicize the Plan! Keep people updated on the progress.
- Put information in media (TV, paper) so people are thinking about these things constantly.

➤ **Calabash**

- Want to see results of the implementation of Hawai'i 2050 publicity campaign.
- How do you balance sustainability with a capitalistic lifestyle.



GROUP 4

➤ Discussion: Plan goals, strategic actions and indicators

What are the positives – things that are really important or on point?

- None

What are the negatives – things that you don't agree with or don't understand?

- Language is not mandatory.
- 5 year process must be open and revised.
- Make a long term plan – ongoing program.
- Functional indicators.
- Initial statistical process to support sustainability.
- Executive exercise and counseling.
- Report card – who, what, how?
- Measuring sustainability – more specific: foundation (culture) – must have deep culture_change; economic system, national security system, education system, lōkahi, aloha, 'olu'olu, environmental system, adopted curriculum, media documented, kūpuna, homeless rate, sharing contribution, poverty rate, high school students get aloha cards; sustainable energy – solar (energy loan program, affordable energy system, alternative energy (equitable, beneficial), efficient energy (tax free), cheaper way, homegrown energy, maintenance electricity in home, geothermal energy plant, more balance for alternative energy, every household can put up alternative efficient energy systems.
- Business, military (water problem).
- Hawai'i electricity company takes more responsibility as an industry.
- Lack of emphasis on elderly.
- Technical training (education and business) for our labor market; tech education is necessary_for labor demand.
- More responsibility (military unit).
- Every community self sufficiency rate 70% by 2050

What do you think is missing from this section of the plan that is critical?

- Each community and island has different wants and needs.
- Cultural sustainability and global culture (e.g. Philippines) – the right combination.
- Stronger trademark intellectual cultures.
- What is sustainability?
- What is sustainable practice?



- Water energy control (10 min in shower, water from shower can go to the garden).
- Recycling water system using grey water (e.g., building costs).
- Outside: international culture. How can we use what we take?
- Native culture can combine with international culture.
- Part II: Hi-Five program (funding, money, \$5 to \$8 million) – use to sustain community.
- Military – take more than responsibly for abuse of the land.
- Promote more agriculture.
- Indicators – more specific, culture has to be a foundation.
- Aim at “OLA” society.
- Control resources – water (water for agriculture, aquaculture).
- Less population doesn’t address self determination, militarization, assumption of global economy, lack of transparency.
- Making the tourist industry responsible for the use of resources – water, trash.



➤ **Discussion: Concept of Sustainability Council**

What do you see as the strengths of the proposed Sustainability Council?

- None

What are the shortcomings or weaknesses?

- Transparency, “representative”.
- Point to implement.
- Sub-advisory group is not representative.
- How does the advisory committee relate to the main group (primary counsel?)
- Five year process – will it be open or close?
- More directed, specific.
- Should be action packed.
- Accountability of Council members.
- How will you get rid of bad board members?

How can we engage the general public in taking action to promote Hawai‘i’s sustainability?

- Empower people to do sustainable things.



Comments Sheet

Comments on Goals, Strategic Actions, and Indicators

- Just because students leave Hawai'i for education, it is not bad. It's when they don't come back that makes me worried.
- More presence of senior citizens in the overall plan. They are not really addressed. Senior citizens take a back seat to youth/adult issues.
- Micro-energy alternatives: instead of promoting large scale energy plants perhaps explore options that can be implemented on a small scale for each household.
- Change building codes to actually promote environmentally friendly practices.
- How can one individual contribute? I consider Goal #3: The Environment and Natural Resources, Strategic Action: reduce reliance on fossil fuel, conserve daily water supply by shortening showers and shutting off instead of leaving water on, emphasize importance of recycling, educate on ways to provide greater protection for the land and conserve agriculture, and educate how weather changes and causes tropical storms by community seminars, work seminars, and school field trips or classes. The best way to help Hawai'i is to educate Hawai'i and with the knowledge change will come and benefit this island and all of Hawai'i.
- To address tourism and adding true Hawaiian values, practices and skills as well as arts, crafts, and way of life.
- Cultural properties and intellectual property.
- Why do you think people should be either pro-business or environment? Be both.
- Your SMS survey is setting up a war and seeing how much people are willing to pay for "environment" instead of promoting a dialogue.

Comments on Ensuring Implementation and Accountability

- Balance of representation in the composition of Council members? Will each interest be exclusively represented by a member? In other words, is there a member who represents only Kanaka Maoli issues? Or, a bunch of issues.
- How to get rid of ineffective board members?
- The Council should have members that are able to represent at a minimum 3 or 4 areas of expertise and interests. Good candidates not token members.
- Is the process to revise and amend the Hawai'i 2050 plan transparent? Is there a public engagement process?
- Will the Sustainability Council be able to pick and choose where and when it can implement the actions? The Hawai'i 2050 plan is broad. Communities may not want the board's goals in their areas. Molokai doesn't want development as in construction but I'm sure they want educational development.
- Have a student on the committee for sustainability to ensure the youth acknowledges their responsibility and part in our environment.
- Language is not mandatory.
- Have advisory sub groups created as a representative to the sub group or Board.



- Measure and carry out data, documentation, and media. Indicator or report card, public awareness, and education.
- Business – caps and regulations; need to give back to community; population control – locals bearing weight of outside population wants.

Additional Comments

- Advisory groups must be established. They must be empowered to discuss the topics. They must be open. Additional subgroups for each island must be created.
- Less of a military footprint!
- More focus on culture. It's the keystone!
- More outreach? More community attendance! More opportunities to INTERACT. Submitting comments is good but inadequate. Community engagement meetings are interactive!
- Educate through community seminars, work seminars, school seminars, and military education.
- Have a national recycle day like earth day and continue to push the importance of recycling. Have separated garbage cans for glass, plastic, paper, etc.